



Pre-Budget Monitoring and Evaluation Comprehensive Report

Date: 05 – 07 October 2018

- 1. Introduction:** The Harare Residents Trust (HRT) takes seriously its mandate to monitor Harare City Council pre-budget consultative meetings within communities on a yearly basis. These pre-budget meetings are conducted by the City of Harare in line with the Ministerial Guidelines identified as Local Government Circular Number 3 of 2012 which give guidelines on how to produce a city budget, designed by the Ministry of Local Government, Public Works and National Housing. Harare has 46 council wards and each of the councillors has to hold one pre-budget consultative meeting ahead of the adoption of the 2019 City of Harare budget. As part of the Monitoring and Evaluation exercise for the 2019 Budget, the HRT used its monitoring template in the scrutinizing of the pre-budget meetings, setting residents' priorities and checking to see that the officials and councillors conducting the pre-budget meetings are following similar procedures and delivering in the same manner. This report gives details of proceedings for each scheduled pre-budget meeting that was held between 05 and 07 October 2018. The narrations contained in this report were provided by HRT representatives who were deployed to observe and document all the proceedings at the meetings. They were assigned to check the content, the conduct of the meetings, the unpacking of the 2018 budget, performance by the council officials, noted the participation and concerns raised by residents in the meetings.

- 2. Executive Summary:** A total of **36** pre-budget consultative meetings were held from **05 to 07 October 2018**. A total of **4 312** residents attended the meetings, being **1 910** women. This is against the average attendance of 100 people per meeting which the HRT considers a fair representation of the ward. The key issues raised by residents in no particular order of importance are; water, road maintenance, refuse collection, drainage system, primary and secondary schools, tower lights, street lighting, road humps and boreholes.

2.1. The meetings:

Date of Meeting	Number of Council Officials	Ward	Venue	Attendance		Total Attendance
				Female	Male	
05/10/18	6	44	Kuwadzana 8 Primary School	39	40	79
05/10/18	4	30	New Glen View Hall	34	38	72
05/10/18	9	10	Sunningdale Community Hall	20	17	37
05/10/18	10	4	Mai Musodzi Community Hall	25	33	58

05/10/18	5	21	Mabvuku Hall	50	93	143
05/10/18	8	24	Lusaka Creche	71	53	124
05/10/18	6	14	Kambuzuma Community Hall	49	70	129
05/10/18	4	43	Budiriro 5 Ok	23	37	60
05/10/18	3	32	Sophie Hall	25	30	55
05/10/18	5	33	Budiriro Community Hall	70	41	111
05/10/18	5	40	Dzivarasekwa 2 Community Hall	65	80	145
05/10/18	4	34	Unit A Community Hall Mufakose	64	48	112
05/10/18	3	15	Magamba Hall	21	44	65
06/10/18	4	42	Hatcliff Community Hall	25	85	110
06/10/18	4	35	Rutendo Hall	63	77	140
06/10/18	8	20	Tafara Hall	32	47	79
06/10/18	7	12	Stodart Hall	32	26	58
06/10/18	6	1	Ground near Hopely Hospital	531	705	1236
06/10/18	6	39	Dzivarasekwa Community Hall 3	38	60	98
06/10/18	8	26	Zororo Centre	79	61	140
06/10/18		46	Old Tafara Hall	36	24	60
06/10/18	6	37	Kuwadza 2 Community Hall	42	52	94
06/10/18	5	6	Town House	15	11	26
06/10/18	3	31	Glen View 1 Community Hall	19	39	58
06/10/18	4	8	Highland District Office	17	19	36
06/10/18	3	3	Mai Musodzi Hall	36	40	76
06/10/18	7	11	Gym Netball Complex	25	31	56
06/10/18	4	29	Glen Norah A Community Hall	18	41	59
06/10/18	4	28	Chembira Hall	55	80	135
06/10/18	4	22	Hatfield	8	27	35
06/10/18	6	45	Dzivarasekwa 1 Community Hall	60	31	91
06/10/18	4	27	Glen Norah Community Hall	130	128	258
07/10/18	10	16	Mabelreign Park	11	44	55
07/10/18	5	19	Mabvuku Area D	22	42	64

07/10/18	5	13	Rugare Primary School	32	48	80
07/10/18	8	38	Kuwadzana 6 Full Day Centre	28	50	78
TOTALS				1 910	2 392	4 312

3. Resident's Needs which have to be addressed by the City of Harare

- 3.1.** The main priority of residents in Harare is provision of clean, adequate and potable water as well as considering refurbishing the entire water distribution network so as to minimise frequent water pipe bursts in the communities.
- 3.2.** The road network has to be attended to urgently as they have become death traps to motorists as well as causing massive damages to their vehicles and as a result drains their economic resources.
- 3.3.** The City of Harare should cut their rates by at most 30 percent. The ongoing 50 percent rates discount has proven that residents can actually pay more if the rates are reduced, thus increasing revenue inflows.
- 3.4.** Money that was illegally paid to suspended council directors should be fully recovered, or the council should pursue criminal charges against the implicated directors. That money belongs to ratepayers, and Council should not treat the matters for granted.
- 3.5.** The residents want the balance between salaries, administration and service delivery to be found so that more revenues go towards service delivery. Salaries are still too high, and the council should seriously consider their total work force, and relate it with the revenues and priorities, because council is not an employment agency.
- 3.6.** The Harare drainage system has been neglected for years such the storm water drains are chocking with debris. The residents fear that the approaching rainy season will cause flooding which can cause disasters as people end up drowning especially children who are more vulnerable.
- 3.7.** The low attendances by the residents have been a cause for concern. From previous recommendations, this point keeps coming up because from the HRT's position it makes no sense to have a meeting that has thirty five (35) people which cannot be a sample large enough to represent the aspirations of over 3 000 households in certain wards. Therefore, the Urban Council Act-UCA should be amended to put a quorum for Pre-budget meetings. This will help in validating or legitimising proceedings of the meetings. The priorities set out by residents will be a true reflection of the people in respective wards.
- 3.8.** The residents still demand to be provided with information- notes attached to the financials, on the performance of their respective wards so that when they debate, they are debating on issues that they know of and have a meaningful input. Residents view this as a ploy to deny them their right to information on operations of their council.
- 3.9.** Residents also demanded that they be notified in advance on the upcoming consultation meetings either on their monthly bill statements, smses on their mobile phones or a flier blitz. This will ensure full participation of residents and ensure that their priorities are taken down and put in the budget for efficient and effective service delivery. The residents believe that if they are more informed they will attend these budget consultation meetings more informed.

4. Harare City Officials said all projects not finished in 2018 will automatically be priorities for 2019. Ongoing projects that Harare City Council is implementing.

This is wrong in the eyes of the Harare Residents' Trust (HRT). There is a new council with a new mandate, hence the Councillors must set their own priorities without being manipulated and railroaded by council bureaucrats to maintain focus on projects not completed in 2018. Instead the new Council must investigate why these projects remain incomplete yet they have been on the council's plans in every financial year. Below are the major priorities highlighted by council officials during the budget consultative meetings;

- 4.1. Pipe replacement
- 4.2. Refurbishment of Morton Jaffray which is at 91%
- 4.3. Road network rehabilitation
- 4.4. Retention fund- 25%- disbursements to District Offices though the money was not coming
- 4.5. Bought refuse compactors- 14 have been delivered, and 16 are outstanding due to foreign currency shortages.
- 4.6. Build Hopley Youth Centre and Hopley Satellite Clinic
- 4.7. Wide Area Network- Connectivity- 80% complete
- 4.8. Public lighting- tower lights and street lights
- 4.9. Recreational facilities

5. Budgetary Allocations Vs Residents Needs

No budgetary allocations were presented.

6. Strategic Plan and Annual Plan for 2018

- 6.1. Acquisition of refuse truck – 30 refuse compacter
- 6.2. Morton Jaffrey refurbishment
- 6.3. Replacement underground water pipes to reduce non-revenue water- ongoing
- 6.4. Wide Area Network- connectivity of district offices
- 6.5. Twenty five percent retention of Income at Zonal level
- 6.6. Refurbishment of water and waste water treatment plant including distribution network
- 6.7. Prepaid water meter installations
- 6.8. Purchase of road maintenance equipment
- 6.9. Road maintenance and rehabilitation
- 6.10. Housing: Private, public partnerships
- 6.11. Upgrading of clinics

7. Performance of 2018 Budget- These are the projects that were reportedly done up to 2018 using the 2018 budget.

- 7.1. Refurbishment of water and waste water treatment plant including distribution network
- 7.2. Morton Jaffray Project at 91% complete (contract specific)
- 7.3. Water output has increased to 515 mega litres a day from 400 mega-litres a day
- 7.4. Pipe replacements ongoing to reduce non-revenue water
- 7.5. Connectivity- Wide Area Network and Local Area Network – 99% complete

7.6. Purchase of 25 NP200 service vehicles trucks- at a total cost of \$461 250.00

8.1. Refuse Collection

Assets	COST
6 x 20 cubic refuse compactors @ \$153 799.00 each (9 delivered)	922 794.00
24 X 12 cubic refuse compactors @ \$90 530.00 each (5 awaiting ZIMRA Clearance)	2 172 720.00
10 Skip bin loaders @ \$152 999.00 each (delivered)	1 529 990.00
50 skip bins @\$6 087.00 each (delivered)	304 376.00
TOTAL	4 929 880.00

- i. Housing and Social Services- Tariro Hopley Youth Centre at 78% complete under public and private partnership
- ii. Health- Hopley satellite Clinic at 85% complete at a cost of \$700 000.00
- iii. Glen Norah/Chitubu Primary School Care at 55% complete at a total cost of \$350 000.00
- iv. Erection of a security wall at Glen View Poly Clinic and Glen View Satellite Clinic at a cost of \$22 000.00.
- v. Road maintenance and rehabilitation

8. Lessons Drawn from the City of Harare Budget Performance

Over the years, the budget consultations by the City of Harare have lacked enough information that enables residents to input on the process on an informed position. Thus the budget presentations are devoid of critical information. A good example is that the budget presentations were not given to residents to check and verify that the information being presented to them is indeed correct or not. The financial burden is piled on to the resident as the City of Harare council lacks initiatives to find alternative sources of revenues so that they do not rely on ratepayers only. It is evident that the officials in the City of Harare are happy to manipulate the councillors, and the councillors do not help matters because they are ignorant of their mandates, given that they have not yet been inducted on council business since coming into office.

On the other hand residents have come to appreciate the role these budget consultative meetings play in their lives as they determine how the city will prioritise their needs and aspirations. The residents have realised that their input plays a pivotal role in resource allocation which impacts positively or negatively on service delivery.

9. The 2019 Strategic Plan and Priorities

- 9.1. Roll over 2018 uncompleted and programmes and projects
- 9.2. Capacitation of all service oriented programmes with priorities to water and sanitation in weak of disease outbreak.
- 9.3. Water and Sanitation rehabilitation programmes. Morton Jaffray etc (Water official to expound)
- 9.4. Addition to refuse fleet and provision for adequate fuel stock for refuse trucks
- 9.5. Road Maintenance and rehabilitation
- 9.6. Addition of more markets at designated areas
- 9.7. Rehabilitation of public toilets

9.8. Replacement underground water pipes to reduce non-revenue water- ongoing

9.9. Twenty- five percent retention of Income at Zonal level to be provided

9.10. Repairing street lighting

10. The HRT Analysis: The trend from previous consultations shows that the number of residents continues to go down every year. Residents feel that Council is not taking service delivery issues seriously which shows lack of commitment to address residents' concerns. Council officials continue holding meetings without providing enough copies of a revenue and capital budget and also revenue and expenditure statement. However this was a great improvement from previous cases where City of Harare could not provide even a single copy of summary sheet. Council officials continue to give city priorities for the rest of Harare betraying their deception on the decentralisation model, which must be seeing the council presenting ward or zonal based detailed income and expenditure reports as well as priorities. This prompted residents to demand a ward based city budget and also suburban performance schedule. Communication is still very poor in council with council officials apparently not well coordinated. Council still dwells in Stone Age using Stone Age methods for communication instead of embracing modern technologies. Residents showed the zeal to be largely involved in the budgeting process such that they will be able to pay their bills willingly thereby increasing the overall council revenues. Residents expressed great concern over the privatisation of council properties such as parking bays around the CBD and Harare Crasher.

The knowledge of budgeting has significantly increased as most of them have been presenting budgetary issues rather than service delivery grievances. The HRT continues to educate residents on the key budget issues to tackle, and residents are showing signs of enhanced knowledge and capacity.

11. Conclusion: Pre-budget consultative meetings held by the council every year need to be taken seriously as the fulfilment of resident's rights depends on them. The feedback received from stakeholders needs to be implemented so that residents feel motivated to come for the meetings. Publicity of the meetings to residents still remains a problem as council is failing to effectively mobilise citizens to attend their meetings. The HRT will continue to monitor the pre-budget meetings, and will table its findings, observations and analysis to relevant stakeholders to ensure that there is effective interaction between duty bearers and rights holders.

Contact Details: programs@hrt.org.zw, hrthre@hrt.org/hretrust79@gmail.com, 08677109781, 0772 380 927, 0772 869 294/ 0774 306 380, and www.hrt.org.zw